



MAP ACADEMY

Methodology, Analytics & Psychometrics



Promises & Pitfalls of Modern Meta-Analysis

Amy L. Dent

April 24, 2015

Overview of Presentation



Overview of Presentation

- Importance of Integrating Research
- Defining Meta-Analysis
- Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis
- New Approach to Meta-Analysis
- Conclusion



Importance of Integrating Research



Importance of Integrating Research

- Across the social and behavioral sciences, the most topical areas of research are *growing* and *diversifying* faster than ever.



Importance of Integrating Research

- Across the social and behavioral sciences, the most topical areas of research are *growing* and *diversifying* faster than ever.
 - self-regulation



Importance of Integrating Research

- Across the social and behavioral sciences, the most topical areas of research are *growing* and *diversifying* faster than ever.
- The most trustworthy theoretical refinements and practical solutions take into account an entire body of empirical evidence.



Importance of Integrating Research

- Across the social and behavioral sciences, the most topical areas of research are *growing* and *diversifying* faster than ever.
- The most trustworthy theoretical refinements and practical solutions take into account an entire body of empirical evidence.
- As a result, empirically-grounded theoretical and practical progress is more challenging than ever.



Importance of Integrating Research

- Integrating research to produce this progress is thus an essential yet increasingly difficult goal.



Importance of Integrating Research

- Integrating research to produce this progress is thus an essential yet increasingly difficult goal.
- *A methodologically rigorous and substantively sound* way of doing so is necessary for confidently translating research into policy or practice.



Importance of Integrating Research

- Integrating research to produce this progress is thus an essential yet increasingly difficult goal.
- *A methodologically rigorous and substantively sound way of doing so is necessary for confidently translating research into policy or practice.*
- Meta-analysis uniquely accomplishes this ultimate goal of applied research.



Defining Meta-Analysis



Defining Meta-Analysis

- A systematic, comprehensive, and objective method of integrating and reconciling the empirical literature on a broad research question through a quantitative synthesis of primary studies or secondary datasets



Defining Meta-Analysis

- A **systematic**, comprehensive, and objective method of integrating and reconciling the empirical literature on a broad research question through a quantitative synthesis of primary studies or secondary datasets



Defining Meta-Analysis

- A systematic, **comprehensive**, and objective method of integrating and reconciling the empirical literature on a broad research question through a quantitative synthesis of primary studies or secondary datasets



Defining Meta-Analysis

- A systematic, comprehensive, and **objective** method of integrating and reconciling the empirical literature on a broad research question through a quantitative synthesis of primary studies or secondary datasets



Defining Meta-Analysis

- A systematic, comprehensive, and objective method of **integrating** and reconciling the empirical literature on a broad research question through a quantitative synthesis of primary studies or secondary datasets



Defining Meta-Analysis

- A systematic, comprehensive, and objective method of integrating and **reconciling** the empirical literature on a broad research question through a quantitative synthesis of primary studies or secondary datasets



Defining Meta-Analysis

- A systematic, comprehensive, and objective method of integrating and reconciling the **empirical literature** on a broad research question through a quantitative synthesis of primary studies or secondary datasets



Defining Meta-Analysis

- A systematic, comprehensive, and objective method of integrating and reconciling the empirical literature on a **broad research question** through a quantitative synthesis of primary studies or secondary datasets



Defining Meta-Analysis

- A systematic, comprehensive, and objective method of integrating and reconciling the empirical literature on a broad research question through a **quantitative synthesis** of primary studies or secondary datasets



Situating Meta-Analysis Among Research Synthesis Strategies



Situating Meta-Analysis Among Research Synthesis Strategies

1. Qualitative Synthesis

2. Quantitative Synthesis



Situating Meta-Analysis Among Research Synthesis Strategies

1. Qualitative Synthesis

integrating research through a
narrative account of its characteristics

2. Quantitative Synthesis



Situating Meta-Analysis Among Research Synthesis Strategies

1. Qualitative Synthesis

integrating research through a
narrative account of its characteristics

2. Quantitative Synthesis

integrating research through a
numeric account of its characteristics



Situating Meta-Analysis Among Research Synthesis Strategies

1. Qualitative Synthesis

integrating research through a
narrative account of its characteristics

2. Quantitative Synthesis

integrating research through a
numeric account of its characteristics



Defining Meta-Analysis

- A systematic, comprehensive, and objective method of integrating and reconciling the empirical literature on a broad research question through a **quantitative synthesis** of primary studies or secondary datasets



Defining Meta-Analysis

- A systematic, comprehensive, and objective method of integrating and reconciling the empirical literature on a broad research question through a quantitative synthesis of **primary studies** or secondary datasets



Defining Meta-Analysis

- A systematic, comprehensive, and objective method of integrating and reconciling the empirical literature on a broad research question through a quantitative synthesis of primary studies or **secondary datasets**



Defining Meta-Analysis

- A systematic, comprehensive, and objective method of integrating and reconciling the empirical literature on a broad research question through a quantitative synthesis of primary studies or secondary datasets



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
 - relation between constructs
 - effect of an intervention
 - difference between groups



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis: Framing the Research Question



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis: Framing the Research Question

What is the *overall relation* between self-regulation and academic achievement?



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis: Framing the Research Question

What is the *overall relation* between self-regulation and academic achievement?

What theoretical and methodological factors *moderate* this overall relation?



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis: Framing the Research Question

What is the *overall relation* between self-regulation and academic achievement?

What **theoretical** and methodological factors *moderate* this overall relation?

- specific construct
- grade level
- academic subject



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis: Framing the Research Question

What is the *overall relation* between self-regulation and academic achievement?

What theoretical and **methodological** factors *moderate* this overall relation?

- type of self-regulation measure
- type of achievement measure



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis: Framing the Research Question

What is the *overall relation* between self-regulation and academic achievement?

What theoretical and methodological factors *moderate* this overall relation?



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
 - relation between constructs
 - effect of an intervention
 - difference between groups



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis: Defining the Parameters



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis: Defining the Parameters

What is the *overall relation* between self-regulation and academic achievement?



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis: Defining the Parameters

What is the *overall relation* between self-regulation and academic achievement?

... becomes ...

What is the overall relation between the *capacities* of self-regulation and academic achievement *across childhood and adolescence*?



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.
 - relation between constructs = r , b^*
 - effect of an intervention = d
 - difference between groups = d



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.
5. Specify inclusion & exclusion criteria.



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.
5. Specify inclusion & exclusion criteria.
 - parameters of the meta-analysis (inclusion)
 - sample size (exclusion)
 - population characteristics (exclusion)



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.
5. Specify inclusion & exclusion criteria.
6. Conduct a comprehensive literature search.



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.
5. Specify inclusion & exclusion criteria.
6. Conduct a comprehensive literature search.
 - electronic databases
 - professional listservs & prominent scholars
 - references



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.
5. Specify inclusion & exclusion criteria.
6. Conduct a comprehensive literature search.
 - electronic databases
 - professional listservs & prominent scholars
 - references
 - keep thorough records



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.
5. Specify inclusion & exclusion criteria.
6. Conduct a comprehensive literature search.
7. Collect information from studies.



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.
5. Specify inclusion & exclusion criteria.
6. Conduct a comprehensive literature search.
7. Collect information from studies.
 - theoretical & methodological moderators
 - effect size information
 - sample & setting characteristics



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.
5. Specify inclusion & exclusion criteria.
6. Conduct a comprehensive literature search.
7. Collect information from studies.
8. Integrate findings.



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.
5. Specify inclusion & exclusion criteria.
6. Conduct a comprehensive literature search.
7. Collect information from studies.
8. Integrate findings.
 - models of error
 - average weighted effect size
 - heterogeneity analysis



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.
5. Specify inclusion & exclusion criteria.
6. Conduct a comprehensive literature search.
7. Collect information from studies.
8. Integrate findings.
9. Reconcile findings.



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.
5. Specify inclusion & exclusion criteria.
6. Conduct a comprehensive literature search.
7. Collect information from studies.
8. Integrate findings.
9. Reconcile findings.
 - moderator analyses to explain variation
 - shifting unit of analysis



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.
5. Specify inclusion & exclusion criteria.
6. Conduct a comprehensive literature search.
7. Collect information from studies.
8. Integrate findings.
9. Reconcile findings.
10. Report & interpret findings.



Steps of Conducting a Meta-Analysis

1. Identify an area of research ripe for meta-analysis.
2. Select a broad research question.
3. Define the parameters of your meta-analysis.
4. Quantify the relation of interest.
5. Specify inclusion & exclusion criteria.
6. Conduct a comprehensive literature search.
7. Collect information from studies.
8. Integrate findings.
9. Reconcile findings.
10. Report & interpret findings.



Thanks!

Dent, A. L. (in prep). Uncovering common ground:
Using meta-analysis to identify and reconcile inconsistencies
in the way constructs are labeled, defined, and measured.



Questions?

adent2@unl.edu



Collaborations?

adent2@unl.edu

